1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
2	FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS FORT WORTH DIVISION	
	10101	MORTIN DIVIDION
3	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	. CRIMINAL ACTION NO.
4	VS.	. 4:03-CR-188-A
5		:
6	RICHARD MICHAEL SIMKANIN	. January 7, 2004 . 9:00 a.m.
7		•
-	VOLUME IV TRIAL TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS	
8	BEFORE THE HONORABLE JOHN H. McBRYDE	
9	UNITED STATES DIS	TRICT JUDGE, and a jury.
10	ADDEAD ANGEG	
11	APPEARANCES:	
12	For the United States:	Mr. David L. Jarvis Assistant United States Attorney
13		801 Cherry Street, Suite 1700 Fort Worth, Texas 76102 (817) 252-5200
14		
15		Mr. Robert A. Kemins U.S. Department of Justice 717 North Harwood, Suite 400
16		Dallas, Texas 75201 (214) 880-9781
17	For Defendant Simkanin:	Mr. Arch C. McColl, III
18		McColl & McColloch 1601 Elm Street, Suite 2000
19		Dallas, Texas 75201-4761 (214) 979-0999
20	Official Court Reporter:	Eileen M. Brewer
21		424 United States Courthouse 501 West Tenth Street
22		Fort Worth, Texas 76102-3637
23		(817) 850-6661
24	Proceedings recorded by mechanical stenography, transcript produced by computer-aided transcription.	
25		

```
1 PROCEEDINGS,
```

- 2 (Jury deliberating, 9:00 a.m.)
- 3 (Jury notes, 9:25 a.m.)
- 4 (On record, defendant present, 10:15 a.m.:)
- 5 THE COURT: Good morning.
- 6 MR. JARVIS: Good morning, Your Honor.
- 7 THE COURT: Okay. We have two more notes from the
- 8 jury. What I'm referring to as the second note, which is the
- 9 first one we received this morning, is: Please give us the
- 10 full wording of the law, and then it has a parenthesis and an
- 11 "S" after that, that the defendant allegedly broke for the
- 12 first 12 indictments.
- 13 And then the third note, which is the second we received
- 14 this morning, is: What are the three points that must be met
- 15 for Counts 13 through 27?
- 16 I've prepared a proposed response and I've given it to the
- 17 attorneys. Does the government have any objection to the
- 18 proposed response?
- MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 20 THE COURT: Does the defendant have any objection to
- 21 the proposed response?
- MR. McCOLL: Yes, Your Honor, we do.
- THE COURT: Okay.
- 24 MR. McCOLL: We would respectfully request the Court
- 25 to define "material," because that was part of the explanation

- 1 to the jury, and without that definition of material on page 2,
- 2 they have no juror guidance as to what material is, and I doubt
- 3 they can remember from 15 pages of oral instruction, with all
- 4 due respect.
- 5 Secondly, Your Honor, based on these piecemeal requests
- 6 for different instructions, we would again urge the Court to
- 7 submit the entire written instruction to the jury, and we
- 8 believe that would be appropriate to ask the Court to do that
- 9 in light of these three notes. And the failure to do so, we
- 10 believe, denies him the Sixth Amendment right to fair trial and
- 11 the Fifth Amendment right to due process.
- 12 THE COURT: Okay. I'm going to grant your first
- 13 request. I'll add the words that were used on page 9 of the
- 14 charge relative to "material" on page 2 of my response
- 15 following the elements of the offenses charged by Counts 13
- 16 through 27 of the indictment. I deny the second request.
- 17 Now, I received a -- it was delivered to Chambers a few
- 18 minutes ago -- well, about half an hour ago. Something filed
- 19 by the defendant called motion for reconsideration and request
- 20 for pattern jury instruction regarding mistake, ignorance, and
- 21 negligence, or gross negligence, and good faith instructions
- 22 under Cheek versus U.S.
- Mr. McColl, I couldn't find in the Pattern Jury Charge --
- 24 you didn't give me a reference to the section of the Pattern
- 25 Jury Charge that you're referring to. Would you tell me what

- 1 section that is.
- 2 MR. McCOLL: I was actually referencing your earlier
- 3 instruction you gave the jury.
- 4 THE COURT: I'm wanting to know what section of the
- 5 Pattern Jury Charge you're telling me in this motion I have
- 6 failed to comply with.
- 7 MR. McCOLL: I'm referencing your instruction -- I
- 8 assumed, Your Honor, that because --
- 9 THE COURT: You made reference to the Pattern Jury
- 10 Charge, Mr. McColl, and told me that it said a certain thing,
- 11 and I want you to tell me the section you were referring to, if
- 12 you were.
- MR. McCOLL: I was, and --
- 14 THE COURT: And what section in the Pattern Jury
- 15 Charge were you referring to?
- MR. McCOLL: Your Honor, I assumed the Court knew
- 17 that, because you put it in your instruction in the previous
- 18 case.
- 19 THE COURT: Is there a section in the Pattern Jury
- 20 Charge you were referring to, Mr. McColl?
- 21 MR. McCOLL: There is and I --
- 22 THE COURT: Would you please tell me what it is?
- MR. McCOLL: I can go find out, Judge. I thought the
- 24 Court knew that, based on your giving it to the jury --
- 25 THE COURT: Here's the Pattern Jury Charge,

- 1 Mr. McColl -- Mr. McColl, we're not going to take up the time
- 2 for that now. When you represent something to the Court, be
- 3 prepared to back up your representation.
- 4 MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 5 THE COURT: I have searched the Pattern Jury Charge,
- 6 based on your representation to me that the Pattern Jury Charge
- 7 required a certain thing. I cannot find anything in the
- 8 Pattern Jury Charge that backs up what you say. In Section 296
- 9 of the Pattern Jury Charge, the word "willful" is written in
- 10 the context of an income tax violation, or is defined in the
- 11 context of an income tax violation, that -- with intent to
- 12 violate a known legal duty, which is basically what we have.
- 13 Mr. McColl, you do need to remember your duties as an
- 14 officer of the Court not to make misrepresentations to the
- 15 Court, or if you do make representations to the Court, be
- 16 prepared to back them up.
- 17 MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 18 THE COURT: You can be seated. I deny your request.
- 19 Okay. Now, my plan, unless there's an objection, would be
- 20 to have the response that we have just discussed, the second
- 21 and third notes, delivered to the jury by handing it to the
- 22 foreperson at the jury room door, having the court security
- 23 officer do that. Does the government have any objection to
- 24 that?
- MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.

```
1 THE COURT: Does the defendant have any objection to
```

- 2 that?
- 3 MR. McCOLL: Your Honor, the defendant would like the
- 4 instruction read to the jury in open court.
- 5 THE COURT: Pardon?
- 6 MR. McCOLL: The defendant would like the instruction
- 7 to the jury read in open court.
- 8 THE COURT: The defendant would like me to bring the
- 9 jury into the courtroom and read the response to the jury at
- 10 that time?
- MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 12 THE COURT: Okay. We'll do that.
- MR. McCOLL: And, Your Honor, I may have
- 14 misunderstood the Court. Did you deny my motion this morning
- 15 that was filed for reconsideration?
- 16 THE COURT: I denied the motion we've talked about.
- MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir. Thank you.
- 18 THE COURT: Okay. I'll be making the change that
- 19 we've discussed in the response while the jury is being brought
- 20 into the courtroom.
- 21 (Court in recess, 10:21 a.m.)
- 22 (On record, jury and defendant present, 10:24 a.m.:)
- 23 THE COURT: Good morning. Okay. I have your second
- 24 and third notes, and I brought you into the courtroom so I can
- 25 read the responses to those notes while you're in the

- 1 courtroom.
- 2 Members of the jury, I have your second and third notes,
- 3 which are worded as follows: The second note, please give us
- 4 the full wording of the law, and then it has a parentheses
- 5 after it with an "S" in it, that the defendant allegedly broke
- 6 for the first 12 indictments. Signed by the foreperson.
- 7 And then a third note: What are the three points that
- 8 must be met for Counts 13 through 27. Signed by the
- 9 foreperson. Both of them dated today.
- 10 Now, in answer to your second note, I'm reminding you of
- 11 the following instructions I gave you earlier. Counts 1
- 12 through 12 of the indictment charge the Defendant, Richard
- 13 Michael Simkanin, willfully failed to collect, account for, and
- 14 pay over taxes due and owing to the United States of America
- 15 from the wages of employees of Arrow Custom Plastics for
- 16 certain tax quarters. Title 26, United States Code, Section
- 17 7202, makes it a crime for any person who is required to
- 18 collect, to account for, or to pay over any tax to willfully
- 19 fail to do so.
- The exact wording of the part of Title 26, United States
- 21 Code, Section 7202, that is pertinent to your decision is as
- 22 follows: "Any person required under this title to collect,
- 23 account for, and pay over any tax imposed by Title 26, United
- 24 States Code, who willfully fails to collect or truthfully
- 25 account for and pay over such tax shall be guilty of a crime."

- 1 Now, in answer to your third note: You're reminded of my
- 2 instruction that, and then this is the wording I previously
- 3 instructed you.
- 4 For you to find the defendant guilty of the crimes charged
- 5 by Counts 13 through 28 (sic) of the indictment, you must be
- 6 convinced that the government has proved each of the following
- 7 beyond a reasonable doubt as to the count of the indictment
- 8 under consideration.
- 9 First, that the defendant knowingly presented to an agency
- 10 of the United States a false or fraudulent claim against the
- 11 United States;
- 12 Second, that the defendant knew that the claim was false
- 13 or fraudulent; and
- 14 Third, that the false or fraudulent claim was material.
- 15 A claim is "material" if it has a natural tendency to
- 16 influence, or is capable of influencing, the agency to which it
- 17 was addressed. It is not necessary to show, however, that the
- 18 government agency was in fact deceived or misled.
- 19 Of course, you will bear in mind in your deliberations all
- 20 other instructions the Court has given you concerning the law
- 21 applicable to this case.
- 22 I am returning herewith to you the originals of the notes
- 23 to which this responds, and you are to retain to be delivered
- 24 to the Court at the conclusion of your deliberations all of
- 25 your communications with the Court and all of the Court's

- 1 communications to you, including, of course, this response, if,
- 2 in fact, it is delivered to the jury room.
- 3 Let me ask the government: Does the government oppose
- 4 having the written version of this response delivered to the
- 5 jury room?
- 6 MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor. And I believe on the
- 7 elements, the Court may have misspoke. It's 13 through 27.
- 8 I think the Court said 13 through 28 on the counts.
- 9 THE COURT: Okay. If I did, it's 13 through 27.
- 10 That's what your note said, and if I did, I correct that. I'm
- 11 sorry I misspoke.
- MR. JARVIS: We have no objection, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Does the defendant have any objection to
- 14 the jury receiving what I just told them in writing?
- MR. McCOLL: No objection, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. I haven't put it in final form,
- 17 but I will put it in writing and have it delivered to the jury
- 18 room with the court security officer handing it to the
- 19 foreperson.
- Okay. You can retire to resume your deliberations.
- 21 (Jury out, 10:29 a.m.)
- 22 (Jury note, 11:00 a.m.)
- 23 (On record, defendant present, 11:17 a.m.:)
- 24 THE COURT: Okay. We have what the juror has
- 25 designated as its number four note, which reads -- the jury,

- 1 which reads: Since no proof has been made that the defendant
- 2 and his employees are in an occupation listed in those 7,000,
- 3 are we to conclude that they are, in fact, not in that 7,000,
- $4\,$  or do we need to read all 7,000 to see what the defendant was
- 5 referring to, and, in fact, wasn't listed in the 7,000.
- 6 The attorneys have my proposed response, which gives the
- 7 text of the note. And the proposed response is: In answer to
- 8 your note, you're instructed that you do not need to concern
- 9 yourself with whether defendant's employees are in an
- 10 occupation listed in those 7,000. And I put in quotes "listed
- 11 in those 7,000." The Court has made the legal determination
- 12 that within the meaning of Title 26, United States Code,
- 13 Section 7202, "during the years 2000, 2001, 2002, Arrow Custom
- 14 Plastics, through its responsible officials, had a legal duty
- 15 to collect by withholding from the wages of its employees, the
- 16 employees' share of social security taxes, Medicare taxes, and
- 17 federal income taxes, and to account for those taxes and pay
- 18 the withheld amounts to the United States of America." You
- 19 are to follow that legal instruction without being concerned
- 20 whether there might be certain employers who are not required
- 21 to collect and withhold taxes from the wages of their
- 22 employees.
- 23 And then I go on: Of course, you will bear in mind that
- 24 your deliberations -- bear in mind in your deliberations all
- 25 other instructions the Court has given you concerning the law

- 1 applicable to this case.
- 2 I'm returning herewith the original of the note to which
- 3 this responds. You're to retain to be delivered to the Court
- 4 at the conclusion of your deliberations all of your
- 5 communications to the Court and all the Court's communications
- 6 to you, including, of course, this communication to you and the
- 7 note from you to which this communication responds.
- 8 Does the government have any objection to my proposed
- 9 response?
- 10 MR. JARVIS: Your Honor, we would request that the
- 11 years listed, you have 2000, 2001, and 2002, be expanded to
- 12 include 1997, 1998, and 1999 to cover Counts 13 through 27 of
- 13 the indictment. That's the only request we have, Your Honor,
- 14 to make it clear it covers that six-year period since those six
- 15 years are covered in the indictment.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. I'll grant that request. That's
- 17 1997, 1998, and 1999?
- 18 MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor. In addition to the
- 19 2000, 2001, and 2002.
- 20 THE COURT: And I'll take out the quotation marks,
- 21 since that will not be literally what I put in the charge.
- 22 MR. JARVIS: Other than that, no objection, Your
- 23 Honor.
- 24 THE COURT: Okay. Does the defendant have any
- 25 objection to the proposed response?

- 1 MR. McCOLL: Yes, Your Honor, we do. We would, first
- 2 of all, object that there was insufficient evidence to prove
- 3 the Court's legal statement beginning with "the Court has made
- 4 a legal determination that," et cetera, down through the word
- 5 "America."
- 6 And, secondly -- and it amounts to an instructed verdict
- 7 of guilty by instructing them on that point since that is the
- 8 disputed issue and the basis for his defense.
- 9 Third, we would object to expanding the years as requested
- 10 by the government because that was not in response and not
- 11 requested by the jury in their note. It goes beyond that and
- 12 is therefore not responsive.
- 13 THE COURT: Okay. I'll overrule those objections.
- Does the government have any -- unless there's an
- 15 objection, my plan would be to have this delivered to the jury
- 16 by having the court security officer hand the response to the
- 17 jury foreperson at the jury room door.
- Does the government have any objection to that?
- MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 20 THE COURT: Does the defendant have any objection to
- 21 that?
- 22 MR. McCOLL: Yes, Your Honor. The defendant has
- 23 asked that it be read in open court, and we do have one
- 24 additional objection I forgot to mention to the Court.
- THE COURT: Okay.

```
1 MR. McCOLL: At the bottom it says, "You are to
```

- 2 follow that legal instruction without about being concerned
- 3 whether there might be certain employers who are not required
- 4 to collect and withhold the taxes." We would ask the Court,
- 5 under Rule 201 of the Federal Rules of Evidence, that the
- 6 evidence show that there are certain employers. It was
- 7 unrebutted in the evidence that there are certain employers who
- 8 are not required to collect and withhold. So that would be a
- 9 misstatement under the evidence in this case, and we
- 10 respectfully request the Court to change "might be" to "are,"
- 11 A-R-E.
- 12 THE COURT: Does the government have any objection to
- 13 that?
- 14 MR. JARVIS: I wasn't real clear on which --
- THE COURT: He wants it to read: You are to follow
- 16 that legal instruction without being concerned whether there
- 17 "are" certain employers, instead of "might be." I'm going to
- 18 make that change whether the government likes it or not.
- 19 (Court in recess, 11:23 a.m.)
- 20 (On record, jury and defendant present, 11:26 a.m.:)
- 21 THE COURT: Okay. I have the number four note from
- 22 the jury, and I have a response that I'm going to read to you
- 23 at this time.
- 24 Members of the jury, I have your note which is worded as
- 25 follows: Four. Since no proof was given that the defendant

- 1 and his employees were in an occupation listed in those 7,000,
- 2 are we to conclude that they are in fact not in that 7,000, or
- 3 do we need to read all 7,000 to see what the defendant was
- 4 referring to and, in fact, wasn't listed in that 7,000. Signed
- 5 by the foreperson and dated today.
- 6 Now, in answer to your note: You are instructed that you
- 7 do not need to concern yourself with whether defendant's
- 8 employees are in an occupation "listed in those 7,000." The
- 9 Court has made the legal determination that within the meaning
- 10 of Title 26, United States Code, Section 7202, during the years
- 11 1997, 1998, 1999, 2000, 2001, and 2002, Arrow Custom Plastics,
- 12 through its responsible officials, had a legal duty to collect,
- 13 by withholding from the wages of its employees, the employees'
- 14 share of the social security taxes, Medicare taxes, and federal
- 15 income taxes, and to account for those taxes and pay the
- 16 withheld amounts to the United States of America. You are to
- 17 follow that legal instruction without being concerned whether
- 18 there are certain employers who are not required to collect and
- 19 withhold taxes from the wages of their employees.
- Of course, you will bear in mind in your deliberations all
- 21 other instructions the Court has given you concerning the law
- 22 applicable to the case. I'm returning herewith the original of
- 23 the note to which this responds, at least I think that's what
- 24 we'll do, and you're to retain the original -- retained to be
- 25 delivered to the Court at the conclusion of your deliberations

- 1 all of your communications to the Court and all the Court's
- 2 communications to you, including, of course, this communication
- 3 to you and the note from you to which this communication
- 4 responds.
- 5 Okay. Does the government have any objection if I
- 6 actually deliver the response in written form to the jury?
- 7 MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 8 THE COURT: Does the defendant?
- 9 MR. McCOLL: No objection, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. I'll ask the court security
- 11 officer to just hand this to juror number one. And y'all can
- 12 retire back to the jury room to resume your deliberations.
- 13 (Jury out, 11:29 a.m.)
- 14 (Lunch break, 12:00 p.m. until 12:30 p.m.)
- 15 (Jury note.)
- 16 (On record, defendant present, 1:54 p.m.:)
- 17 THE COURT: Okay. We've received note number five
- 18 from the jury, and I've given the attorneys a proposed
- 19 response, which contains the text of the note. The note is:
- 20 Can a juror change their mind after a vote is taken that was
- 21 unanimous? That's signed by the foreperson.
- 22 In response, the response I propose to make is: In answer
- 23 to your question -- Well, it says too much. I'm going to take
- 24 out the second "in answer to your question." It will be simply
- 25 that the answer to your question is yes. And then I'll give my

- 1 usual instructions, the last two paragraphs that I've always
- 2 given about bearing in mind the other instructions and
- 3 returning the note and so on.
- 4 Does the government have any objection to my proposed
- 5 response?
- 6 MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 7 THE COURT: Does the defendant have any objection to
- 8 my proposed response?
- 9 MR. McCOLL: No, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. Does the defendant want me to
- 11 bring the jury in to read this response to them?
- MR. McCOLL: He does, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Okay. Why don't you get the jury in.
- 14 (Jury in, 1:57 p.m.)
- 15 THE COURT: Okay. I have the fifth note from the
- 16 jury, which reads: Can a juror change their mind after a vote
- 17 is taken that was unanimous? And the answer to your question
- 18 is yes.
- 19 Now, the formal response I prepared goes on to say that,
- 20 of course, you will bear in mind in your deliberations all
- 21 other instructions the Court has given you concerning the law
- 22 applicable to the case. And then the usual instructions about
- 23 returning with the response the original of your note, and both
- 24 of them, along with all other communications, should be kept
- 25 and returned.

```
1 Does the government have any objection to the text of the
```

- 2 response itself being delivered to the jury?
- MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 4 THE COURT: Does the defendant?
- 5 MR. McCOLL: No, Your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Okay. We'll deliver the text of the
- 7 response. I have to make a correction. I made a typographical
- 8 error. I do that every now and then. I've got to make a
- 9 correction. Once I make the correction, I'll have it delivered
- 10 to the jury room.
- 11 (Jury out, 1:58 p.m.)
- MR. McCOLL: Your Honor, I filed a motion and
- 13 memorandum regarding that citation you wanted.
- 14 THE COURT: Okay. We'll study it.
- MR. McCOLL: Thank you.
- 16 THE COURT: When was it filed?
- MR. McCOLL: About 30 minutes ago.
- 18 THE COURT: Okay. We'll study it.
- 19 (Court in recess, 1:59 p.m.)
- 20 (Jury note, 3:17 p.m.)
- 21 (On record, no jury, no defendant present, 3:26 p.m.:)
- THE COURT: Where is the audience?
- MR. McCOLL: Well, we asked them to not come in.
- 24 THE COURT: Mr. McColl, who instructed somebody to
- 25 take the audience out of the courtroom?

- 1 MR. McCOLL: Nobody did.
- 2 THE COURT: Well, who instructed them not to be in
- 3 here?
- 4 MR. McCOLL: I didn't instruct anybody to do
- 5 anything.
- 6 MR. JARVIS: I didn't talk to anybody either, Judge.
- 7 THE COURT: Do you know why there's nobody in the
- 8 audience?
- 9 MR. KEMINS: The courtroom has been locked for
- 10 security reasons.
- 11 THE COURT: Okay. Y'all wanted to meet with me about
- 12 something?
- 13 MR. McCOLL: Yes, Your Honor. To avoid trying this
- 14 case a third time, even in the event of a --
- THE COURT: Pardon?
- 16 MR. McCOLL: We wanted to approach the Court and ask
- 17 if you could rule on the defendant's motion for judgment of
- 18 acquittal so that even if there is a conviction in the case
- 19 there would not be further litigation.
- 20 THE COURT: You mean if I grant the judgment of
- 21 acquittal?
- MR. McCOLL: No, sir.
- 23 THE COURT: I'm not sure I understand what you're
- 24 talking about.
- 25 MR. McCOLL: Well, we just thought in terms of

- 1 orderly procedure that we would ask the Court to grant the
- 2 motion -- I mean, rule on the motion. We presume -- I presume
- 3 it's going to be denied, but just to have it in the record that
- 4 it was denied.
- 5 THE COURT: Okay. Well, I'm going to deny the motion
- 6 for acquittal that I received, what, about an hour ago?
- 7 MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 8 THE COURT: I don't know whether it's timely or
- 9 whether it's properly filed or properly worded or anything
- 10 else. I'm just going to deny it because --
- 11 MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 12 THE COURT: -- there's nothing in it that would cause
- 13 me to think that it should be granted.
- MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 15 THE COURT: I also have a motion you asked about the
- 16 last time we were in here, the one you filed at 1:07, and that
- 17 has to do -- it's a motion and memorandum regarding citation
- 18 for mistake, negligence, et cetera. And I'm denying that
- 19 motion.
- MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 21 THE COURT: Now, it so happens -- and do stand at the
- 22 door and don't let anybody in until we finish discussing this.
- 23 It so happens that the jury had wrote a note that I got about
- 24 the time I started to walk in here, and here's a copy for each
- 25 of you.

- 1 (Brief pause.)
- 2 THE COURT: Okay. I think both of you have had time
- 3 to read it. It appears to me the options the Court has at this
- 4 time in response to this is -- one option is to give the jury a
- 5 modified Allen charge, telling them to try to reach a verdict
- 6 as to Counts 1 through 12 and that they can, even though
- 7 they've already marked in the blank spaces on that, they can
- 8 use those same blank spaces to enter whatever verdict they do
- 9 reach, if they unanimously reach a verdict. That's one option.
- 10 The other option is to inform the jury of their right to
- 11 return a partial verdict and give them whatever instructions we
- 12 need to give them relative to that. And then instruct them,
- 13 once they return their partial verdict, we would like for them
- 14 to resume their deliberations as to Counts 1 through 12 in an
- 15 attempt to reach a verdict as to those counts.
- 16 Mr. Jarvis, do you have any thoughts as to what might be
- 17 the most appropriate approach?
- 18 MR. JARVIS: Could I just have a moment, Your Honor?
- 19 THE COURT: Okay.
- 20 (Government counsel confer.)
- 21 THE COURT: So the record will reflect, the
- 22 foreperson didn't sign this, nor did he date it, nor did he
- 23 indicate which note it is. Using his numbering system, I
- 24 assume it's the sixth --
- 25 MR. JARVIS: Six, I believe, Your Honor.

- 1 THE COURT: Fifth note.
- 2 MR. JARVIS: Number six, I believe.
- 3 THE COURT: And from the spelling, he made the same
- 4 spelling errors he made on another one, so I assume it is the
- 5 foreperson.
- 6 MR. JARVIS: I believe it should be number six, yes,
- 7 Your Honor. I believe the one you just handed us, I believe
- 8 should be note six.
- 9 THE COURT: Okay. Well, I'll --
- 10 MR. JARVIS: The last one was five about the --
- 11 THE COURT: I'm going to put a number six at the top
- 12 so we can keep track of them that way. By the way, they gave
- 13 me a note saying they were going to take -- have an overnight
- 14 break. When they were doing that, I didn't tell y'all about
- 15 that because -- last night. And I put a number two on that
- 16 one. It simply said we're going to take an overnight break.
- 17 We'll be back at 9:00 o'clock in the morning. So there may be
- 18 two number twos, that number two plus the one that the
- 19 foreperson numbered two.
- Okay. Do you have any comments, Mr. Jarvis?
- 21 MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor. Is there any way the
- 22 Court could do both, receive a partial verdict and ask them to
- 23 continue to deliberate?
- 24 THE COURT: I think I could do both. I think I could
- 25 give them that option. I could give them an option of -- I

1 think. I'll have to do a little double-checking, but I think I

- 2 can give them an option of continuing to deliberate and do
- 3 nothing else at this time. Or at this time if they want to, to
- 4 return a partial verdict and then to continue to deliberate.
- 5 MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor. Right. I think the
- 6 second option is what we would like.
- 7 MR. KEMINS: And, Your Honor, if I could. We don't
- 8 know if you can, we'll do some research, too, about the
- 9 instruction about continuing to deliberate. Would that be the
- 10 modified Allen charge?
- 11 THE COURT: I would give them a modified Allen charge
- 12 as to continue to deliberate.
- Okay. Do you have any thoughts, Mr. McColl?
- 14 MR. McCOLL: Only, Your Honor, that I think that both
- 15 the United States Attorney and the defense the last time, on a
- 16 research in this similar situation about the choice, reached
- 17 the conclusion that any instruction that they're given should
- 18 not be coercive as to their choice. In other words --
- 19 THE COURT: I understand that, and I think you're
- 20 right on that. But do you agree that we ought to give them the
- 21 choice to return a partial verdict, or, if they wanted to, to
- 22 just continue to deliberate without returning a partial
- 23 verdict?
- MR. McCOLL: Probably give them a choice.
- 25 THE COURT: Okay. Well, let me try to work up

- 1 something. And in the meantime, if either one of you wants --
- 2 if either one of you wants to do some research without getting
- 3 out of reach here where we'll have to find you. Apparently you
- 4 have somebody helping you on your research, Mr. McColl?
- 5 MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 6 THE COURT: And if the government can be doing some
- 7 research on what would be required -- I'll do my own, and let
- 8 me give you some cases to start with. United States versus
- 9 Ross.
- 10 MR. KEMINS: Is that Ross, Your Honor? I'm sorry.
- 11 THE COURT: Ross, R-O-S-S.
- MR. KEMINS: Thank you.
- 13 THE COURT: 626 F.2d 77. United States versus
- 14 Benedict, 95 F.3d 17. United States versus Dilapi,
- 15 D-I-L-A-P-I, 651 F.2d 140. None of these are Fifth Circuit. I
- 16 haven't conducted enough research to know whether there are any
- 17 Fifth Circuit or not.
- 18 The next one is United States versus Dakins, D-A-K-I-N-S,
- 19 872 F.2d 1061. That will get you your headnotes, I think, and
- 20 get you started.
- 21 MR. KEMINS: That was 1061, the page number, sir?
- THE COURT: On the last one?
- MR. KEMINS: Yes, sir.
- 24 THE COURT: 1061.
- MR. KEMINS: Thank you.

```
1 THE COURT: Now, I'm going to ask that you return
```

- 2 those notes to me, because I don't want copies of those notes
- 3 to be disclosed to anyone else for the time being.
- 4 MR. McCOLL: Your Honor, what was the volume number,
- 5 please, on the last citation, Dakins?
- 6 THE COURT: The volume number was 872 F.2d.
- 7 MR. McCOLL: Thank you.
- 8 THE COURT: Let me double-check and see if I have any
- 9 others here.
- 10 (Brief pause.)
- 11 THE COURT: And my thought is -- I want your comments
- 12 -- I think it would be inappropriate for the contents of this
- 13 note to be disclosed to other persons.
- What is your thought on that, Mr. Jarvis?
- MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor, I agree.
- 16 THE COURT: What's your thought on that?
- 17 MR. McCOLL: Well, I don't understand why. I mean --
- 18 THE COURT: Well, do you want it in the newspaper in
- 19 the morning what this note said, if the jury is still
- 20 deliberating?
- 21 MR. McCOLL: Not if the jury is still deliberating.
- 22 THE COURT: We don't know whether it will be or not,
- 23 and presumably the jury will follow my instructions and
- 24 wouldn't read the newspaper anyway. But if you don't have a
- 25 concern --

- 1 MR. McCOLL: Well, I'm concerned --
- THE COURT: I assume you'll tell your client.
- 3 MR. McCOLL: Well, I certainly want to tell my
- 4 client, and I guess my question would be --
- 5 THE COURT: Well, I'm going to give you back your
- 6 copies of this, and then I won't make any restriction on it.
- 7 Do you see any problem with that, Mr. Jarvis, not making
- 8 any restrictions on it?
- 9 MR. JARVIS: Well, I'm just -- I am concerned about
- 10 any -- this being public. I mean, it's contrary to the Court's
- 11 instructions not to mention in open court where they are on
- 12 numbers or anything. I'm very concerned about this.
- 13 THE COURT: Well, I thought about whether or not
- 14 they violated the Court's instructions, and I don't think they
- 15 did because they really didn't -- I guess in a sense they told
- 16 me where they stand numerically. They did in the sense of
- 17 telling me they've reached a verdict, but they didn't tell me
- 18 which way it was.
- 19 MR. JARVIS: Well, they said 1 through 12 is guilty,
- 20 Your Honor. They had a unanimous verdict of guilty on Counts 1
- 21 through 12.
- 22 THE COURT: Well, they haven't told me what they have
- 23 a unanimous verdict on, and they haven't told me what the count
- 24 is on 1 through 12. They told me what it was at one point in
- 25 time, but they haven't told me what it is now.

- 1 MR. JARVIS: Yes, sir.
- 2 THE COURT: They've come pretty close saying "one or
- 3 more."
- 4 MR. JARVIS: Right.
- 5 THE COURT: But one or more could be eleven, I
- 6 suppose.
- 7 MR. JARVIS: That's correct.
- 8 THE COURT: So I don't think the jury has violated my
- 9 instructions. Does anybody have any second thoughts about not
- 10 being prohibited from making a disclosure of the contents of
- 11 this note for the time being, at least.
- 12 (No response.)
- 13 THE COURT: Okay. Apparently not. We'll just leave
- 14 it like it is, then.
- 15 MR. JARVIS: Your Honor, one other -- May I speak on
- 16 another matter?
- 17 THE COURT: Yes.
- 18 MR. JARVIS: Your Honor, if we do get a verdict
- 19 today, and the Court has probably already considered this, but
- 20 we would request that the Court instruct the audience before
- 21 the jury is brought in that there will not be any kind of
- 22 outburst, celebration, booing, or whatever. And I'm just
- 23 concerned about the jury.
- 24 THE COURT: Okay. I'll give them some kind of
- 25 instruction along that line.

```
1 Okay. Y'all be doing some research, and in the meantime
```

- 2 I'll be doing some.
- 3 (Court in recess, 3:40 p.m.)
- 4 (On record, no jury, no defendant present, 3:50 p.m.:)
- 5 THE COURT: This is again on the note asking about --
- 6 what we're calling the sixth note. It's going to take a while
- 7 for us to be sure that we have this right. I'm planning to
- 8 give the jury an interim response which would say, "I'm in the
- 9 process of doing the research I will need to conduct before I
- 10 respond to your note. However, you can be assured that I'm
- 11 working on a response and that I will inform you as soon as I
- 12 have formulated one."
- 13 My thought would be that in the meantime -- I haven't put
- 14 that here. I would say, "In the meantime, you will continue
- 15 your deliberations, bearing in mind the following additional
- 16 instructions," and then give them the modified Allen charge
- 17 instructions at that point.
- Does the government have any problem with that?
- MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 20 THE COURT: Does the defendant?
- 21 MR. McCOLL: Despite the case law being well settled,
- 22 we would respectfully object to the Allen charge, because I
- 23 think that it injects an issue of money and expense as a
- 24 rationale for the jury to reach a verdict, and we think that
- 25 that is not a proper basis to ask the jury to reach a verdict

- 1 and therefore denies him due process and a right to a fair
- 2 trial under the Fifth and Sixth Amendments.
- 3 THE COURT: Okay. I overrule that objection.
- 4 Now, the next question is -- I'll let y'all see what I do
- 5 before I actually inform the jury of it. Do you want the jury
- 6 to be brought up for me to give them the kind of response I'm
- 7 talking about?
- 8 MR. McCOLL: Judge, my client has asked every time
- 9 that there is an exchange --
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. Well, let me get the response
- 11 prepared. It will be prepared consistent with what I just
- 12 said.
- 13 And be getting the defendant up here.
- 14 Oh, one other thing. This means I'll be reading aloud in
- 15 open court the jury's note, and I want to be sure both of you
- 16 are in agreement that you want that to be publicly disclosed at
- 17 this time. What is --
- 18 MR. McCOLL: Well, it's a little late, Judge. You
- 19 sent us out here a while ago saying that there was no
- 20 limitation, so I think it's --
- 21 THE COURT: Have you already --
- MR. McCOLL: Sure.
- 23 THE COURT: -- published it?
- 24 MR. McCOLL: Judge, it was 15 -- ten minutes ago.
- THE COURT: Well, then it's a moot question.

```
1 MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
```

- THE COURT: Who have you given it to?
- 3 MR. McCOLL: My legal assistants, and I'm sure
- 4 they've shared it with others.
- 5 THE COURT: Did you make copies of it?
- 6 MR. McCOLL: No, sir.
- 7 THE COURT: Well, it is too late.
- 8 (Court in recess, 3:53 p.m.)
- 9 (On record, defendant present, 4:19 p.m.:)
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. I've given each of the attorneys a
- 11 copy of the proposed interim response to what we're calling
- 12 note number six, which is drawn consistent with the discussions
- 13 we had when I was in the courtroom last.
- 14 Mr. Jarvis, you indicated that perhaps some agreement had
- 15 been reached between the attorneys?
- MR. JARVIS: I believe so, Your Honor. What we would
- 17 like the Court to do is delete paragraph one on the proposed
- 18 note, as well as the first three words of paragraph two, and
- 19 just give the jury a modified Allen charge. And also delete on
- 20 page 3 the second to last complete paragraph, which starts --
- 21 THE COURT: Let me get back to the first page.
- 22 MR. JARVIS: Yes, sir.
- 23 THE COURT: You want the paragraph, "I'm in the
- 24 process of doing the research I will need to conduct"?
- 25 MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor. Neither side desires a

1 partial verdict. We would like the jury just to continue

- 2 deliberating.
- 3 THE COURT: Neither side does what?
- 4 MR. JARVIS: Neither side desires that the jury be
- 5 informed that they have the option of returning a partial
- 6 verdict. We would just like them to continue deliberating.
- 7 THE COURT: You mean at no point do you want them, in
- 8 response to this note, to have that knowledge?
- 9 MR. JARVIS: Not at this time, Your Honor, and
- 10 perhaps never. But we certainly think that would be premature
- 11 at this time.
- 12 THE COURT: So you want me to take out the first
- 13 paragraph below the text of the note.
- MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 15 THE COURT: And then --
- MR. JARVIS: The first three words of the next
- 17 paragraph.
- 18 THE COURT: So it will start out, "I'm going to ask."
- 19 MR. JARVIS: Yes, sir. And, also, page 3, the second
- 20 to last complete paragraph, which begins with the words, "If
- 21 you have not announced."
- THE COURT: Take that out?
- 23 MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor. And --
- 24 THE COURT: Go ahead.
- 25 MR. JARVIS: And we have not discussed this with

- 1 Mr. McColl, but it just appeared to me that on page 3, the
- 2 paragraph right above that, that says, "So long as you mark
- 3 through any previous notations," it might be appropriate to put
- 4 that at the very beginning of your response before you get into
- 5 the modified Allen. It seems like it would flow better that
- 6 way.
- 7 THE COURT: You mean put it as the second paragraph
- 8 of the response?
- 9 MR. JARVIS: No, the very first paragraph. The first
- 10 part of your response will be, "So long as you mark through any
- 11 previous notations, you may still use the verdict form."
- 12 THE COURT: You would like that to be immediately
- 13 below the text of the note?
- MR. JARVIS: Of the question, yes, Your Honor.
- 15 THE COURT: As opposed to the second paragraph?
- 16 MR. McCOLL: I think it would be smoother as the
- 17 second paragraph.
- 18 THE COURT: I think it should be the second
- 19 paragraph.
- 20 MR. McCOLL: Your Honor, this --
- 21 THE COURT: Let me be sure Mr. Jarvis is -- Are you
- 22 through, Mr. Jarvis?
- MR. JARVIS: Could I have just one moment, please?
- 24 (Government counsel confer.)
- 25 MR. JARVIS: Your Honor, just to recap, you did get

1 the second to last paragraph on page 3, we requested that be

- 2 deleted.
- 3 THE COURT: I'm taking out the second -- Your
- 4 suggestion is I take out, "If you have not announced a
- 5 unanimous verdict."
- 6 MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor. Wholly delete that,
- 7 yes, sir.
- 8 THE COURT: I'm going to recap what I plan to do once
- 9 we get everybody in agreement.
- Now, Mr. McColl, you have expressed disagreement with the
- 11 Allen charge concept generally, and I will assume that you
- 12 still have that disagreement.
- 13 MR. McCOLL: Thank you, Your Honor. Subject to that
- 14 disagreement, and without waiving that, I have no objections to
- 15 the suggestions made by Mr. Jarvis, although I do agree with
- 16 the Court about switching. In other words, which one should go
- 17 first and second. And I think the Court's suggestion, it will
- 18 be smoother to have the order that you suggested in that
- 19 regard. So with those remarks, I think that we're in
- 20 agreement.
- 21 THE COURT: Okay. We'll get this and get the jury up
- 22 and read it to them.
- 23 (Court in recess, 4:24 p.m.)
- 24 (On record, jury and defendant present, 4:29 p.m.:)
- 25 THE COURT: Okay. Members of the jury, I have your

- 1 most recent note, which I've numbered number six. You didn't
- 2 have a number on it so I've added a number. And the note as
- 3 worded: Cannot reach verdict in Counts 1-12. Reached verdict
- 4 in Counts 13-27, reached verdict in Counts 28-31. On the
- 5 verdict form, had marked the Count 1 through 12 as "guilty."
- 6 One or more jurors changed their mind. I mark an "X" and
- 7 initialed each Count 1 through 12. Will this be a problem?
- 8 How will this be announced?
- 9 Now, I'm going to respond to that, which may not be
- 10 exactly what you had in mind, but I think it's an appropriate
- 11 response.
- 12 In response to your note, I'm going to ask that you
- 13 continue your deliberations in an effort to reach an agreement
- 14 as to all counts and dispose of this case; and I have a few
- 15 additional comments I would like for you to consider as you do
- 16 so.
- 17 First, so long as you mark through any previous notations
- 18 you have made in the blank spaces for the jury's verdict as to
- 19 any of the counts, you can still use those blank spaces for
- 20 entry of any verdict the jury unanimously reaches as to any of
- 21 those counts.
- Now, this is an important case. The trial has been
- 23 expensive in time, effort, and money to both the defense and
- 24 the prosecution. If you should fail to agree on a verdict, the
- 25 case is left open and must be tried again. Obviously, another

- 1 trial would only serve to increase the cost to both sides, and
- 2 there's no reason to believe that the case can be tried again
- 3 by either side better or more exhaustively than it has been
- 4 tried before you.
- 5 Any future jury will be selected in the same manner and
- 6 from the same source as you were chosen, and there is no reason
- 7 to believe that the case could ever be submitted to 12 men and
- 8 women more conscientious, more impartial, or more competent to
- 9 decide, and that more or clearer evidence could be produced.
- 10 Those of you who believe the government has proved the
- 11 defendant guilty beyond a reasonable doubt should stop and ask
- 12 yourselves if the evidence is really convincing enough, given
- 13 that other members of the jury are not convinced. And those of
- 14 you who believe that the government has not proved the
- 15 defendant beyond a reasonable doubt should stop and ask
- 16 yourselves if the doubt you have is a reasonable one, given the
- 17 other members of the jury do not share your doubt.
- 18 Remember at all times that no juror is expected to yield a
- 19 conscientious objection (sic) he or she may have as to the
- 20 weight or effect of the evidence. But remember also that after
- 21 full deliberation and consideration of the evidence in the
- 22 case, it is your duty to agree upon a verdict as to all counts,
- 23 if you can do so, without surrendering your conscientious
- 24 opinion. You must also remember that if the evidence in the
- 25 case fails to establish guilt beyond a reasonable doubt as to

- 1 one or more of the counts, the accused should have your
- 2 unanimous verdict of not guilty as to that count or those
- 3 counts.
- 4 You may be as leisurely in your deliberations as the
- 5 occasion may require and should take all the time which you may
- 6 feel is necessary. I will now ask that you retire once again
- 7 and continue your deliberations with these additional comments
- 8 in mind to be applied, of course, in conjunction with all of
- 9 the instructions I previously have given you.
- 10 And then I have the usual language about returning the
- 11 note.
- 12 Does the government have any objection to the text of the
- 13 note being delivered to the jury?
- MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 15 THE COURT: I mean, the text of the response. I'm
- 16 sorry.
- 17 MR. JARVIS: No objection.
- 18 THE COURT: Does the defendant?
- 19 MR. McCOLL: Your Honor, may we approach the bench?
- THE COURT: Yes.
- 21 (Bench conference with lead attorneys:)
- 22 MR. McCOLL: I know it's a bit unorthodox, but I
- 23 would like to make some new law on the basis of the Sixth
- 24 Amendment right to effective counsel. I would like to ask the
- 25 Court the opportunity for three or four minutes, because

- 1 there's been given a new instruction, to be able for the
- 2 prosecution and the defense to argue.
- 3 THE COURT: No, we're not going to do that.
- 4 MR. McCOLL: Yes, sir.
- 5 THE COURT: Well, first of all, what is your reaction
- 6 to it?
- 7 MR. JARVIS: I don't think that's appropriate, Your
- 8 Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: I don't think it is at this point in
- 10 time.
- MR. McCOLL: Okay.
- 12 THE COURT: Okay. Do you object to the jury getting
- 13 the note?
- MR. McCOLL: No, sir.
- 15 (End of bench conference.)
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. You'll retire to the jury room,
- 17 and we'll stay here as long as you want us to stay here. Your
- 18 schedule will determine how long we're here. We work until
- 19 8:00 or 9:00 at night if we have to, so that's up to you. I'm
- 20 going to ask that you go back and work consistent with these
- 21 instructions I've given you.
- Did you hear what I said? My microphone is off.
- 23 (The jury nods heads.)
- 24 THE COURT: And I'll have the court security officer
- 25 give this to the number one juror.

```
1 (Jury out, 4:35 p.m.)
```

- 2 THE COURT: Sit back down a minute. In case we do
- 3 revisit the partial verdict issue, I found two Fifth Circuit
- 4 cases. You probably already found them. United States versus
- 5 White, 972 F.2d 890, and United States versus Wheeler, 802 F.2d
- 6 778.
- 7 MR. JARVIS: Your Honor, would you repeat the first
- 8 cite on White?
- 9 THE COURT: 972 F.2d 890.
- 10 MR. JARVIS: Yes, Your Honor. Thank you.
- 11 (Court in recess, 4:36 p.m.)
- 12 (Jury note, 7:32 p.m.)
- 13 (On record, defendant present, 7:45 p.m.:)
- 14 THE COURT: Okay. I have what the jury foreperson
- 15 has identified as note number seven, another note from the jury
- 16 saying that we have reached a verdict on Counts 3 through 31,
- 17 3-31. We are still deadlocked on Counts 1 and 2. Signed by
- 18 the foreperson.
- 19 I've given the attorneys a proposed response to that. The
- 20 proposed response is: In response, I inform you that you are
- 21 at liberty to return a partial verdict as to Counts 3 through
- 22 31, if you like. But you do not have an obligation to do so.
- 23 If you wish to return a partial verdict, you should be certain
- 24 that your foreperson accurately records the unanimous verdict
- 25 of the jury on the verdict form as to each count of the

- 1 indictment on which you have unanimously agreed. Your
- 2 foreperson should then send the Court a note that the jury
- 3 wishes to return a partial verdict.
- 4 And then I have the usual language about keeping this note
- 5 and my response -- or their note and my response to be
- 6 delivered to the Court at the end of the case.
- 7 What is the government's -- Does the government object to
- 8 my proposed response?
- 9 MR. JARVIS: Could I just have a moment for us to
- 10 discuss it?
- 11 THE COURT: Yes.
- 12 (Government counsel confer.)
- MR. JARVIS: We have no objection, Your Honor.
- 14 THE COURT: Does the defendant have any objection to
- 15 the proposed response?
- 16 MR. McCOLL: Yes, Your Honor. We would object to the
- 17 instruction and ask that they be asked to deliberate further.
- 18 THE COURT: Okay. Well, I'm going to overrule that
- 19 objection, because I think they've -- I think -- well, of
- 20 course, that remains a possibility after we receive the partial
- 21 verdict. So I'm not going to foreclose the possibility that
- 22 they will be required to deliberate further, but I am going to
- 23 give them an opportunity to return a partial verdict if they
- 24 choose to do so. And then decide, if they do, what to do about
- 25 the remaining two counts of the indictment.

```
1 Okay. Get the jury in.
```

- 2 (Brief pause.)
- 3 (Jury in, 7:50 p.m.)
- 4 THE COURT: Okay. I have your most recent note
- 5 saying that we have reached a verdict on Counts 3 through 31
- 6 and we're still deadlocked on Counts 1 and 2.
- 7 Now, in response to that, I inform you that you are at
- 8 liberty to return a partial verdict as to Counts 3 through 31
- 9 if you like, but you do not have an obligation to do so. If
- 10 you wish to return a partial verdict, you should be certain
- 11 that your foreperson accurately records the unanimous verdict
- 12 of the jury on the verdict form as to each count of the
- 13 indictment on which you have unanimously agreed. Your
- 14 foreperson should then send the Court a note that the jury
- 15 wishes to return a partial verdict, and I have the usual
- 16 language in my response about keeping the response and make
- 17 sure that it and the note come back to me.
- Does the government have any objection to the jury having
- 19 the response in written form?
- 20 MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 21 THE COURT: Does the defendant?
- MR. McCOLL: No, Your Honor.
- 23 THE COURT: Okay. I'm going to have the court
- 24 security officer have the written response handed to juror
- 25 number one.

- 1 Hand it to juror number one, and y'all will retire to make
- 2 whatever decision you want to make in response to that note or
- 3 to continue to deliberate. That's your choice.
- 4 (Court in recess, 7:52 p.m.)
- 5 (Partial verdict, 8:00 p.m.)
- 6 (On record, no jury, defendant present, 8:09 p.m.:)
- 7 THE COURT: Okay. We have a note from the jury that
- 8 states that the jury wishes to return a partial verdict, signed
- 9 by the foreperson. I'm going to respond in writing rather than
- 10 bring them directly into the courtroom, and my response I've
- 11 given to the attorneys is: In response to this note, I will
- 12 have you brought into the courtroom. The foreperson should
- 13 have with him when you come into the courtroom the verdict form
- 14 showing the partial verdict you wish to return. And then the
- 15 usual language about returning the note and so on.
- 16 Then my plan will be, after this has been delivered --
- 17 Well, let's see, I failed to think this out. The defendant is
- 18 requiring the jury to be in the courtroom to read this note to
- 19 them, so they'll have that partial verdict with them,
- 20 presumably.
- 21 So I'm going to change my thinking a little bit. My plan
- 22 is to just have the jury come into the courtroom and tell them
- 23 that we'll accept their partial verdict, without any separate
- 24 note.
- Does the government have any objection to that?

```
1 MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor. May we approach,
```

- 2 please?
- 3 THE COURT: No. I don't know of anything you need to
- 4 approach about.
- 5 MR. JARVIS: Your Honor, I just wanted to remind the
- 6 Court --
- 7 THE COURT: I remember. I've been reminded a half
- 8 dozen times.
- 9 MR. JARVIS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: And my -- let me take this another step.
- 11 My plan will be to, once the partial verdict is returned,
- 12 assuming that they don't change their mind between now and the
- 13 time they get in here, my plan would be to question the members
- 14 of the panel about whether there's any possibility that further
- 15 deliberations could result in a verdict as to Counts 1 and 2,
- 16 unless I'm told by counsel for both sides that they're
- 17 satisfied not to pursue that line any further.
- 18 Does the defendant have any objection to my proposed
- 19 course of action as I've outlined it?
- 20 (No response.)
- 21 THE COURT: Does the defendant have any objection to
- 22 my proposed course of action as I've outlined it?
- MR. McCOLL: No, Your Honor.
- 24 THE COURT: Okay. Have the jury -- Oh, one more
- 25 thing, what I've been reminded of. This is to everybody in the

- 1 courtroom. There is a possibility that the jury will be
- 2 returning a verdict at this time, and it could well be a
- 3 partial verdict but it will be a verdict.
- 4 I'm telling everyone in the courtroom that if there's any
- 5 noise made, outcry, clapping, or any sound whatsoever out of
- 6 the audience section, I'm going to have the audience section
- 7 cleared immediately when that occurs.
- 8 (Jury in, 8:12 p.m.)
- 9 THE COURT: Okay. I have the jury's note that the
- 10 jury wishes to return a partial verdict, the note written by
- 11 the foreperson. And I'll ask juror number one: I understand
- 12 you are the foreperson of the jury?
- JUROR NO. 1: Yes, Your Honor.
- 14 THE COURT: Does the jury still wish to return a
- 15 partial verdict?
- JUROR NO. 1: Yes, Your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: And has that verdict been recorded on the
- 18 verdict form?
- JUROR NO. 1: Yes, Your Honor.
- 20 THE COURT: And does the verdict form have the
- 21 verdict of the jury as to each count that a partial verdict is
- 22 to be returned on?
- JUROR NO. 1: Yes, Your Honor.
- 24 THE COURT: And is that the unanimous verdict of the
- 25 jury as to each of those counts?

- JUROR NO. 1: Yes, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: Okay. If you would, hand it to the court
- 3 security officer.
- 4 Okay. I'll ask that the defendant stand while the partial
- 5 verdict of the jury is read by the court coordinator.
- 6 THE COURT COORDINATOR: United States of America
- 7 versus Richard Michael Simkanin. Verdict of the jury. We, the
- 8 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 9 to Count 3 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 10 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, quilty as to Count 4 of
- 11 the indictment.
- 12 We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 13 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 5 of the indictment. We, the
- 14 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 15 to Count 6 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 16 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 7 of
- 17 the indictment.
- 18 We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 19 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 8 of the indictment. We, the
- 20 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 21 to Count 9 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 22 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 10 of
- 23 the indictment.
- We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 25 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 11 of the indictment. We, the

- 1 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 2 to Count 12 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 3 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 13 of
- 4 the indictment.
- We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 6 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 14 of the indictment. We, the
- 7 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 8 to Count 15 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 9 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 16 of
- 10 the indictment.
- 11 We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 12 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 17 of the indictment. We, the
- 13 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 14 to Count 18 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 15 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 19 of
- 16 the indictment.
- 17 We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 18 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 20 of the indictment. We, the
- 19 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 20 to Count 21 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 21 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 22 of
- 22 the indictment.
- We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 24 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 23 of the indictment. We, the
- 25 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as

- 1 to Count 24 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 2 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 25 of
- 3 the indictment.
- We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 5 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 26 of the indictment. We, the
- 6 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 7 to Count 27 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 8 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 28 of
- 9 the indictment.
- 10 We, the jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael
- 11 Simkanin, guilty as to Count 29 of the indictment. We, the
- 12 jury, find the defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as
- 13 to Count 30 of the indictment. We, the jury, find the
- 14 defendant, Richard Michael Simkanin, guilty as to Count 31 of
- 15 the indictment.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. You can be seated. You can be
- 17 seated, Mr. McColl, you and your client.
- 18 Since the law does require the verdict of the jury on any
- 19 count of the indictment to be a unanimous verdict, my practice
- 20 is, after the verdict has been read, to call on each juror by
- 21 number to stand and ask if the verdict that was read is your
- 22 verdict, so there won't be any issue later on as to whether or
- 23 not it actually was a unanimous verdict. So I'm going to do
- 24 that now.
- 25 And when I call, if you would stand, and then I'll ask you

- 1 what I'm going to ask you.
- 2 Juror number one, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 3 the counts of the indictment, except Counts 1 and 2, your
- 4 verdict?
- JUROR NO. 1: Yes, Your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 7 Juror number two, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 8 the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- 9 JUROR NO. 2: Yes, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 11 Juror number three, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 12 the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 3: Yes, Your Honor.
- 14 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 15 Juror number four, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 16 the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 4: Yes, Your Honor.
- 18 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 19 Juror number five, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 20 the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 5: Yes, Your Honor.
- 22 THE COURT: Thank you.
- Juror number six, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 24 the counts of the indictment, except Counts 1 and 2, your
- 25 verdict?

- JUROR NO. 6: Yes, sir.
- 2 THE COURT: Juror number seven, is the verdict of
- 3 guilty as to each of the counts of the indictment, except 1 and
- 4 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 7: Yes, it is, Your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 7 Juror number eight, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 8 the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 8: Yes, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 11 Juror number nine, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 12 the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 9: Yes, sir.
- 14 THE COURT: Thank you.
- Juror number ten, is the verdict of guilty as to each of
- 16 the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 10: Yes, it is, Your Honor.
- 18 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 19 Juror number eleven, is the verdict of guilty as to each
- 20 of the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your verdict?
- JUROR NO. 11: Yes, it is.
- 22 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 23 And, juror number twelve, is the verdict of guilty as to
- 24 each of the counts of the indictment, except 1 and 2, your
- 25 verdict?

- JUROR NO. 12: Yes, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: Okay. I'm satisfied that the verdict of
- 3 the jury as to Counts 3 through 31 is the unanimous verdict of
- 4 the jury as to each of those counts, a verdict of guilty.
- 5 Therefore, the Court is accepting the verdict as to those
- 6 counts as a partial verdict of the jury, and I'm signing the
- 7 verdict form to indicate my acceptance of the jury's verdict as
- 8 to Counts 3 through 31 as a partial verdict of the jury.
- 9 Now, the question is: Is there anything to gain -- and
- 10 I'll direct this to juror number one, is there anything to gain
- 11 whatsoever by any further deliberations, in your opinion?
- JUROR NO. 1: No, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: As to Counts 1 and 2?
- JUROR NO. 1: No, Your Honor.
- 15 THE COURT: Are you satisfied that y'all have
- 16 exhausted every line of reasoning between you?
- JUROR NO. 1: Yes, Your Honor.
- 18 THE COURT: I'm just going to pick one other person
- 19 at random and ask that person. I'll -- and I'm going to pick
- 20 one at random. It's number seven. Are you satisfied that
- 21 further deliberations would not accomplish anything by way of
- 22 reaching a verdict as to Counts 1 and 2?
- JUROR NO. 7: Yes, sir.
- 24 THE COURT: You don't think you could talk and talk
- 25 and talk and reason and reason and possibly reach a

- 1 verdict as to either of those counts?
- JUROR NO. 7: No.
- THE COURT: Okay. I'm going to pull another one out
- 4 of the air. Number eleven, who's number eleven? Juror number
- 5 eleven, do you think there's any possibility that further
- 6 discussions and reasoning with each other could result in a
- 7 verdict as to Counts 1 and 2, a unanimous verdict?
- JUROR NO. 11: No, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Okay. You can be seated.
- 10 My inclination is to declare a mistrial as to Counts 1 and
- 11 2. Does the government have any thought that anything other
- 12 than that should be done?
- MR. JARVIS: No, Your Honor.
- 14 THE COURT: Does the defendant?
- MR. McCOLL: No, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. I'm declaring a mistrial as to
- 17 Counts 1 and 2, which means that your job is over. I'm
- 18 ordering -- I'm accepting the verdict, as I've indicated, as a
- 19 partial verdict as to Counts 3 through 31. I'm ordering it
- 20 filed as a partial verdict as to those counts.
- 21 Now, I need to go over some things with the jury that
- 22 don't really relate to the -- they're not trial activities but
- 23 things I need to discuss with the jury, and I would prefer to
- 24 have that discussion without the audience being in the
- 25 courtroom. So I'm going to ask that the audience leave the

```
1 courtroom. As a matter of fact, it's appropriate for us to
 2 close the courthouse anyway except for the participants, so
 3 we'll just go ahead and close the courthouse.
 4
             THE U.S. MARSHAL: Yes, sir.
 5
         (Audience section cleared, 8:26 p.m.)
 6
         (COURT REPORTER'S NOTE: Transcript continues in Volume V
          (under seal). There have been no deletions or
 8
          additions.)
 9
                                 -000-
10
                              CERTIFICATE
         I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript from
11
    the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter. I
12 further certify that the transcript fees format comply with the
    those prescribed by the Court and the Judicial Conference of
13
   the United States.
14
15
   Eileen M. Brewer
                                                Date
16 Official Court Reporter
   Texas CSR No. 3016
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```